Review Report of the Expert Dr. Gari DONN to the accreditation procedure for modification of the administrative decision on accreditation MODUL University Vienna Private University

Accreditation of Dubai as a new location for four study programmes:

"Bachelor of Business Administration in Tourism and Hospitality Management"
"Bachelor of Science in International Management"
"Master of Science in Sustainable Development, Management and Policy"
"Master of Business Administration"

pursuant to section 7 of the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (PU-AkkVO)

Vienna, 10.11.2016

Table of Contents

1 Principles for the procedure

Higher education in Austria

The Austrian higher education system currently comprises:

- 21 public universities;
- 12 private universities, the providers of which are private entities, which have been publicly recognised through accreditation
- 21 universities of applied sciences; the providers are either institutions organised under private law which are subsidised by the state or accredited public entities;
- the university colleges of teacher education are provided by the state or private institutions that have been publicly recognised through accreditation;
- the philosophic-theological higher education institutions are provided by the Catholic Church;
- the Danube University Krems is a state university for postgradual further education, its structure corresponds to a great extent to public universities;
- the tasks of the Institute of Science and Technology – Austria are the appreciation and advancement of new fields of research as well as the post-graduate education in the form of PhD and post-doc programmes.

In the winter semester of 2015[1] around 309,000 students were studying at public universities (incl. the Danube University Krems). Furthermore, approx. 48,100 students were inscribed for a degree programme at a university of applied sciences and approx. 10,200 students at a private university.

External quality assurance

Pursuant to the Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG), public universities must have their internal quality management system certified in the framework of an audit procedure every seven years. There are no legal or financial consequences linked to the certification decision.

Private universities must undergo an AQ Austria-coordinated institutional accreditation procedure every six years. After twelve years of uninterrupted accreditation, the accreditation can be awarded for twelve years at a time. If in the meantime degree programmes or certificate university programmes leading to an academic degree are set up, they also require accreditation.

Universities of applied sciences must have their initial institutional accreditation renewed after six years. After that, they switch to the audit system. The accreditation status is, however, linked to a positive certification decision following the audit procedure. Initial accreditation is required for each degree programme before it may be offered.

---

[1] As of April 2016

Accreditation of private universities and their degree programmes

In Austria, private universities wanting to operate as higher education institutions require institutional accreditation, which has to be renewed on a regular basis. In addition to the institutional accreditation, each degree programme to be offered by the private university requires prior accreditation. Furthermore, changes relevant to accreditation require approval by an administrative decision. Therefore an application for modification of the administrative decision on accreditation needs to be filed. The Agency for Quality Assurance and Accreditation Austria (AQ Austria) is responsible for accreditation.

AQ Austria conducts all accreditation procedures pursuant to the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities[2] (PU-AkkVO). Furthermore, the procedures conducted by the Agency are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area.[3]

AQ Austria appoints experts for the evaluation of accreditation applications. On the basis of the application documents and following a site visit at the applicant institution, the experts draw up a joint review report. The Board of AQ Austria then makes its accreditation decision on the basis of the review report and taking into consideration the applicant institution's comment. If the statutory prerequisites for accreditation are met and the qualitative requirements are satisfied, the submitted degree programme may, by administrative decision, be accredited. In case of a modification of an administrative decision or an extension of an accreditation, accreditation may be granted under conditions.

The Board's administrative decision has to be approved by the Federal Minister for Science, Research and Economy prior to its entry into force. After the procedure has been completed, a report on the outcome of the procedure as well as the expert report shall be published on the websites of AQ Austria and the applicant institution.

The legal bases for the accreditation of degree programmes at private universities are the Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG)[4] as well as the Private Universities Act (PUG)[5].

2 Short information on the accreditation application for the modification of the administrative decision on accreditation of four study programmes

Information on the applicant institution	
Applicant institution	MODUL University Vienna Private University
Legal status	Limited liability corporation (in German: GmbH)
Initial accreditation	30.07.2007

---

[2] Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (PU-AkkVO)

[3] Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)

[4] Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG)

[5] Private Universities Act (PUG)

Date of last extension of accreditation	01.01.2015
Site	Vienna
Number of students	584
Accredited degree programmes	• Bachelor of Business Administration in Tourism and Hospitality Management • Bachelor of Business Administration in Tourism, Hotel Management and Operations • Bachelor of Science in International Management • Master of Science in International Tourism Management • Master of Science in Sustainable Development, Management and Policy • Master of Science in Management (*accreditation still subject to approval by Ministry*) • Master of Business Administration (certificate university programme) • Master of Business Administration in Sustainable Development and Management (certificate university programme) • Doctor of Philosophy in Business and Socioeconomic Sciences

Information on the study programmes subject to changes				
Name of study programmes	**Bachelor of Business Administration in Tourism and Hospitality Management**	**Bachelor of Science in International Management**	**Master of Science in Sustainable Development, Management and Policy**	**Master of Business Administration**
Type of study programmes	Bachelor degree programme	Bachelor degree programme	Master degree programme	Certificate university programme
ECTS	180	180	120	90
Regular study period	8 Semester	6 Semester	4 Semester	4 Terms (18 months)
Maximum intake per year	max. 84	max. 105	max. 30	max. 30
Academic degree	Bachelor of Business Administration in Tourism and Hospitality Management	Bachelor of Science in International Management	Master of Science in Sustainable Development, Management and Policy	Master of Business Administration (MBA)
Study formate	Full time	Full time	Full time, part time is possible	Part time

Language	English	English	English	English
Tuition fee	€ 40.000	€ 40.000	€ 24.000	€ 26.000
Accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna	Vienna	Vienna	Vienna
Accreditation application for the modification of the administrative decision on the accreditation	Changes relevant to accreditation pursuant § 12 (1) PU-AkkVO: Location Application for Dubai as an additional location for all four study programmes			

The accreditation application was submitted by MODUL University Vienna Private University on 27.04.2016. As per resolution of 29.06.2016 the Board of AQ Austria has appointed **Dr. Gari Donn**, University of Edinburgh, as one of four experts for the evaluation of the application. This review report is based on the paper application and focused on specific questions.

3   Explanatory notes of the expert

3.1 I am requested to examine certain documents in relation to the Review for a modification of Accreditation of degree programmes MODUL University Vienna Private University plans to offer at the location Dubai. These documents pertain to quality assurance procedures for accreditation of these degree programmes. I have been advised of the criteria by which 6 key concerns should be addresses and assessed. I am required to examine said documents and make an informed judgement about each of the 6 key areas.

3.2 This Review is one part of the review of the accreditation procedure. Alongside this documentary Review, a site visit by other team members is taking place. Subsequent to that visit, a Report will be written and submitted. This Review will be read alongside that Report. Both Reports will be the basis for the decision taken by the Board of AQ Austria.

3.3 I have tried, wherever possible, to provide a clear and comprehensive account of the quality of the degree programmes, and its practicability, taking into account the institutions resources.

3.4 I have noted the fact that MODUL University Vienna Private University has operated degree programmes within the European Higher Education Area (EHEA) and this has been the foundation for the development of the campus at Dubai ("MODUL University Dubai").

3.5 Background understanding leads me to note that Quality Assurance (QA) within the European context has developed from the Bologna Declaration (1999) and has been phased into the International context with the Berlin Declaration (2003). This specified that there should be 'a definition of responsibilities of the bodies and institutions involved; evaluation of programmes or institutions, including internal assessment, external review' (2003:3). The

idea that quality assurance should include both external and internal review was embedded in Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the EHEA (ENQA Report 2005).

3.5.1 External QA has remained a key quality control mechanism in Higher Education (HE). There are two main external QA mechanisms – external checks of institutions and accreditation requirements. QA systems, developed to create sustained quality cultures, require agreement on expectations and meanings in each stage of the QA process. In the current Review, this is crucial for campuses, agencies and institutions as the complex nature of HE with its multiple stakeholders can be open to misinterpretations.

3.5.2 The definitions one uses for QA become extremely important. One definition could be to view quality in terms of exceptional or high standards. This is represented by elite universities which are frequently commended for their institutional and programme performance, especially in relation to as cutting-edge research and doctoral degrees.

A second meaning for quality in HE is when an institution or programme conforms to standards. For an institution to start a program or achieve a particular status, it has to conform to certain standards that could be quantitative or qualitative or both. This is the approach used by the majority of quality agencies to evaluate HEIs. If this conformance is rewarded with a license or approval granted to education provider, then this conformance is called **accreditation.**

A third meaning is quality as 'fitness for purpose' where a focus is on whether the service or product does what it promises and is expected to do. Despite the fact that this meaning triggers controversial questions regarding the appropriateness of the purposes and who determines them in the first place (stakeholders, government, funders or the institution itself), context plays an important role in answering these questions.

3.5.3 Further issues relate to cross-border or transnational education. The Council of Europe in the Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education (2002) defines TNE as: '*All types of higher education study programmes, or sets of courses of study, or educational services (including those of distance education) in which the learners are located in a country different from the one where the awarding institution is based. Such programmes may belong to the education system of a State different from the State where the programme was created'.*

In these circumstances, 'quality' in HE may require revision; as Knight also argues (Donn and Al Manthri 2013) currently cross-boarder programme provision aims to achieve 'the same' or of 'comparable' quality. Delivering educational quality in the cross-border programme therefore requires the 'transfer' or reproduction of the values, understanding and methods identified with the home programme. Knight goes on to argue that UAE is one country which is trying to position itself as an 'education hub' – to develop a critical mass of education/knowledge actors and to strengthen its efforts to exert more influence in the new market place of education. '*The concept of a national education hub rests on the assumption that it is a country's plan to position itself within the region and beyond as a reputed centre for higher education and research. An education hub is a planned effort to build a critical mass of local and international actors strategically engaged in cross border education, training, knowledge production and innovation initiatives'.* Knight (2011)

UNESCO/OECD guidelines govern the reliance on using a home programme as a single point of reference and as a single measure of quality. Jacques Hallak, UNESCO Assistant Director-

General of Education has noted that 'the danger is that companies selling education outside their frontiers will attempt to impose the same standards everywhere, and this will dissociate education from the social, cultural and political origins of a country'. As noted by UNESCO, encouraging the sameness of quality does not necessarily mean ensuring quality although, of course, having a basis for comparison is necessary. Therefore, one would wish to ensure that providers include requirements that allow quality measuring to be context-sensitive.

3.5.4 Additionally, as seen in the current Review, countries such as the UAE encourage distinguished HEIs to set up campuses in their own countries. It can benefit a host country's HEIs by linking them with prestigious partners. However, to ensure this is the case in the UAE and Gulf region, various assurance and accreditation bodies have been established. The primary task of these agencies has been quality recognition and assurance of domestic higher education provision by public and/or private higher education institutions. Historically, as Knight argues (Donn and Al Manthri 2013; 192) national QA agencies have generally not focused their efforts on assessing the quality of imported and exported programmes. The question now facing the sector is how to deal with the increase in cross-border education by traditional higher education institutions and the new private commercial providers who are not normally part of nationally based QA schemes.

3.6 In light of the above, I am aware that quality assurance poses the question of how to guarantee to students and other stakeholders that programmes are of adequate quality and that TNE providers have been approved for this task.

3.6.1 A crucial point to consider in this situation (and for this Review) is the way a provider is operating. In the case of MODUL University Vienna and Campus Dubai, the provider is a franchised institution. Responsibility to assure the equality of cross-boarder education should lie with the receiving country, preferably through coordination with the awarding body (ENQA, 2010) However, UAE and Dubai, in particular, have established branch campuses in a free zone which means they are exempt from the regulations of the Commission for Academic Accrediation, a federal body. The KHDA, established in 2008, is the responsible QA body for HEI in the free zones of Dubai. This is known as the University Quality Assurance International Board (UQAIB). It is this body who will review the QA arrangements of the HEI and make recommendations, approve new programmes and branch campuses and renew these approvals regularly.[6] In addition, any changes have to undergo accreditation by AQ Austria according to Austrian regulations, because MODUL University Vienna wants to offer Austrian degree programmes at another location.

3.7 At this point, it is possible to indicate that there are many competing versions of 'quality', these emerging from differing conceptions of provisions for cross-border HE. Whilst it is important to recognise the possibilities for increased access to HE, and as Knight argues 'for strategic alliances between countries and regions; for the production and exchange of new knowledge through academic/industry partnerships; for the mobility of graduates and professionals; for human resource and institutional capacity building; for income generation;

---

[6] With franchised relations, usually the awarding body is responsible of quality and subject to its own national quality assurance regulations. Hence, the host country will be included in these regulations and will be addressed through codes of good practices such as the case with Australia, UK and USA. For example: Australia has the *Code of Ethical Practice in the Offshore Provision of Education and Educational Services* by Australian Higher Education Institutions - Australian Vice-Chancellors Committee. UK has the *Code of Practice for Overseas Collaborative Provision in Higher Education* - Higher Education Quality Council (1996); Quality Assurance Code of Practice: Collaborative Provisions - Quality Assurance Agency. Furthermore, the USA has the *Principles of Good Practice for Educational Programs for Non-U.S. Nationals* - it is shared among the regional institutional accrediting bodies of the USA.

for improvement of academic quality; and for increased mutual understanding', (Donn & Al Manthri 2013:198) there are also potential risks and negatives. The current Review takes seriously these issues and submits the following Report.

Using documentation I have been provided with, I submit the following assessment:

4 Statements and assessments based on the assessment criteria pursuant to PU-AkkVO

4.1 Have the accountability and responsibilities of the main institution (MODUL University Vienna Private University) and the other location (Campus Dubai) been clearly defined and are they adequate? (§ 14 (5) d)

In responding to this question, I look for evidence in the documents that accountability and responsibility of MODUL University Vienna Private University and Campus Dubai have been clearly defined.

In commencing this search, I note the following contexts:
1. Ownership: Campus Dubai – independent legal entity, fully funded and wholly owned by DIID Management DMCC – joint venture company between Dach and DII
2. Programs directed: by MODUL University Vienna Private University, licenses by KHDA (government of Dubai), accredited by AQ Austria (in progress)
3. Aim: to provide quality education on UG and professional level EQUIVALENT to study degree programs at home campus Vienna.

It is important to recognize that the organisation and administration of MODUL University Vienna Private University applies also to Campus Dubai in relation to Development Plan; Examinations Regulations; Student Code of Conduct; Study Regulations; Academic Regulations for Changing study programs; Rules on Readmission, Credit Transfer, changing study programs; Regulations for Election of Members to the University/Campus Senate; Habilitation and Promotion Guidelines; Rules of Procedure for Collegial Bodies of MODUL University Vienna.

Bodies planned to be implemented at Campus Dubai: Campus Board (consisting of Academic Head and Managing Director); Program area directors; Campus Senate; semester conference; admissions committees.
According to the "Guidelines of Academic Self-Administration at Dubai Campus", the Campus Board makes unanimous decisions. If they do not agree, the decision is moved to Vienna. They have signatory authority over functions assigned and hold regular meetings.
The Academic Head is appointed by the University Board of MODUL University Vienna Private University from full and associate professors at Dubai. The Academic Head is responsible for all academic affairs, notably study degree programs as directed by University Board of MODUL University Vienna Private University; quality management of human resources among faculty. (Deputy – longest serving program area director.)

The Managing Director is appointed by DACH, responsible for all economic, financial, administrative matters, personnel decisions for daily administrative operations on Campus. (Deputy – Managing Assistant.)

The Campus Board is responsible for the following functions: drafting Dubai Mission Statement (in accordance with MS of Vienna); Setting academic calendar; preparation of annual budget and financial statements for DACH; drafting proposals on establishment and restructuring organizational units and introduction, change, discontinuation of study programs following consultation with University Senate of MODUL University Vienna Private University – for resolution by University Board of MODUL University Vienna Private University; Initiating rules and administrative processes related to academic affairs of Campus Dubai in compliance with requirements for local authorities in UAE; Appointing members of administrative committees for study programs in Dubai; Making decisions on the interruption of studies of students and termination of student contracts; appointing staff and faculty members (although full and associate professors are only appointed upon previous recommendation by a search committee and external teaching staff only appointed upon recommendation by the respective program area director); confirming tuition fees (in the UAE competitive environment) of all programs at the beginning of each academic year to the University Board of MODUL University Vienna Private University; implementation of Vienna QA measures and instruments; acquiring required UAE licenses for the operation of the campus in Dubai; approving content of PR and advertising material; drafting proposals for appointments committees for resolution by Dubai Campus Senate; preparing an annual report on activities of Dubai Campus following requirements of AQ Austria; preparing annual quality management report to MODUL University Vienna Private University; making decisions on necessary adjustments of study and examination regulations when proposed by Dubai Campus Senate; drafting proposals concerning amendments to guidelines of academic self-administration at Dubai following consultation with University Senate for resolution by MODUL University Vienna Private University.

Additionally, in the "Guidelines of Academic Self-Administration at Dubai Campus" accountability and responsibility are also defined for Program Area Directors, Campus Senate, Studies and Examinations Committee, Semester Conference, Admissions Committee, Equal Opportunity Employer Working Party, Student Representatives (to fulfill the tasks as 'outlines in the university regulations' – although the mentioned regulations were not part of the application documents), Appointment procedure for academic staff, Appointments Committee during the foundation phase, Habilitation and promotion Committees, Supervision and Assessment of UG and PG theses, Guidelines for the dedication of rooms, Academic staff and responsibilities.

Furthermore the "Guidelines of Academic Self-Administration at Dubai Campus" include regulations regarding Quality Management. It is stated that mechanisms and strategies are employed by the university for ensuring appropriate management of academic quality and standards, promoting good practice, enhancing student experience. All teaching staff and student representatives have a role in assuring quality. It is specified that within six months of start of each academic year, Campus Board reports on development of academic quality in teaching and research to University Board of MODUL University Vienna Private University, including aspects of Research, teaching/education, other services, external accreditations and audits.

Describe Reasons for Outcome of Assessment
The documents I have examined present a thorough and coherent explanation of the organization of Accountability and Responsibilities between Vienna and Dubai.

Has criterion been met?
Yes

4.2 Is MODUL University Vienna Private University able to assert the quality of its study programmes in Dubai and exercise its responsibilities? (§ 14 (5) d)

In responding to this question, I look for evidence in the documents that MODUL University Vienna Private University is able to assert the quality of its study programmes at Campus Dubai and exercise its responsibilities.

The study programs offered by Campus Dubai are structured in modules. Each program area Director is responsible within the scope of their authority for all matters concerned with the instruction within their study program modules.

The Program area Directors' functions include representing and developing the subject area and associated research fields with respect to the development plan and to other university bodies; ensuring the teaching program complies with the curriculum; assuring the quality of teaching within the corresponding study program modules; assigning the internal teaching staff to the courses following consultation with the Academic President; recommend on external teaching staff (decided by Campus Board); responsibility for resources at their disposal.

According to the "Guidelines of Academic Self-Administration at Campus Dubai" the quality management report (sent to the University Board of MODUL University Vienna Private University by the campus Board) includes information on Research (Faculty development; faculty name; promotions; awards and prizes, conference participations, research community services, research publications, peer-reviewed articles, monographs, conference publications, research projects, basic research, industry research) and Education/Teaching (Faculty development, internal/external teaching ratio, teaching load, professional training, student development, admissions, graduates and study time, grades, student mobility, professional development (internships), graduates leaving survey, courses evaluation, overall by lecturers in comparison and study programs).

In the Application for Accreditation of Study Programs on the Dubai Campus there is sufficient and suitable attention to:
  i)   Quality Assurance at MODUL University Vienna Private University
  ii) Quality awareness in research, teaching and university administration calls for evaluation of QA.
  iii) QA at MODUL University Vienna Private University and its subsidiary: the organization and implementation of evaluation, the review of results and the integration of these findings in future decisions and measures.

It is noted that the Campus management (Campus Board) assumes responsibility for QA and Q improvement measures (QIM). Management determines and prioritises which measures are of strategic importance for the coming academic year. This is appropriate and suitable.

Management designates QA representatives who coordinate and document QA and QIM. Management also decides which advisory body will be involved with which area of QA and the resulting strategies.

Additionally, there is note that an Advisory Board will be introduced at Campus Dubai composed of representatives from both business and academic sectors. The Advisory Board will aid in QA and will advise university management in its response to new developments in curriculum design.

In relation to the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities the qualifications objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.
Further, it is noted that the contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

Describe Reasons for the Outcome of the Assessment
There is much evidence that MODUL University Vienna Private University takes seriously its commitment to ensure the quality of the programs being developed and to be delivered at Campus Dubai.

The structure and procedures for accreditation appear robust. MODUL University Vienna Private University appears to take responsibility for program quality development at Campus Dubai.

Have the criteria been met?
Yes

4.3 Are organisation, management, and support structures established in the same quality as they are maintained at the main institution? (§ 14 (5) d)

In responding to this question, I have looked for evidence in the documents that organization, management and support structures of MODUL University Vienna Private University and Campus Dubai are of the same quality.

Quality Assurance at MODUL University Vienna Private University is embedded in an awareness of QA in research, teaching and university administration.

Quality assurance at MODUL University Vienna Private University and its subsidiary means the organization and implementation of evaluations, the review of results and the integration of these findings in future decisions and measures. It is seen that Campus management (Campus Board) assumes responsibility for quality assurance and quality improvement measures. Management determines which measures are of strategic importance for the coming academic year.

Provision has been made for adequate support structures being available for students seeking advice on scientific, study-related organizational or socio-psychological matters.

Describe Reasons for the Outcome of Assessment
Generally, references appear to indicate that issues of organization, management and structures are taken very seriously and that they have become central foci of concern. This is appropriate and necessary and the focus should be maintained.

Have the Criterion Been Met?
In general, yes

4.4 Is the national legislation at the location in Dubai observed? Are educational traditions and cultural differences, respected – only if and insofar this would not affect the private universities' quality standards? Especially with regard to teaching and learning, including examinations, the students' role in the teaching and learning process as well as in any quality assurance processes? (§ 14 (5) e)

In responding to these questions, I have looked for evidence in the documents that the national legislation at the location in Dubai has been observed; that educational traditions and cultural differences have been respected – only if and insofar this would not affect the private universities' quality standards; and in regard to teaching and learning, including examinations, has the students' role also been observed in the teaching and learning process as well in any quality assurance processes.

It is noted in documentation that the Dubai Campus is an autonomous entity. This is well expressed in the agreement between DACH Advisory and MODUL University Vienna Private University: Subject of the Agreement states that "The Campus will be run and managed by DACH Advisory and its nominated team of experts who will handle all administrative, financial and operational tasks as well as all business development matters in relation to the Campus."

Although not a key concern for this Statement and Assessment (being L&T), it is interesting that reference is made to research collaboration between MODUL University Vienna Private University and Campus Dubai. This is appropriate. According to the Application documents one of the key research topics at Dubai Campus will deal with Community Engagement in Tourism – questions emerge of sustainable development in tourism and hospitality and Sharia'h Compliant Tourism and Hospitality. Tourism is a sector that has been recognized by the Dubai Government as an economic catalyst of the country. Research questions have focused on the following: How Sharia'h compliant hotels are positioned on the fast-growing Dubai tourism and hospitality market? What are perspectives of Sharia'h compliant tourism and hospitality?

Attention, therefore, has been drawn to Intercultural Aspects and Local Traditions and to their consideration in Teaching and Research. Campus Dubai recognizes an emphasis on Middle East traditions and aspects across its teaching and research. There is mention of rigorous research at the Dubai Campus which is aimed at promoting regional values and developments in the areas of tourism and hospitality, business, entrepreneurship, finance and law.

Additionally, international academic and research cooperation and mobility rank on top of Dubai Campus strategy and priorities. While Dubai Campus will benefit from the well-established footprint and network of the Vienna Campus, it aims at building sustainable ties with leading academic and research partners locally, regionally and globally.

Dubai Campus faculty, as suggested in the documentation, will take an active part in promoting the Dubai Campus as a credible academic partner as they bring on board a sophisticated network of relationships amongst well-established academic partners globally.

These efforts are complimented by Dubai's fully integrated research platform, Sustainability through Education and Research (SERC). SERC's mandate is to promote regional efforts in driving sustainability through investment in education, research and social entrepreneurship, as well as to establish a regional hub for collaboration between academia, industry, policy makers and NGOs. Indeed, Dubai Campus is already working on establishing relationships with leading academic institutions globally, including the Universities of Surrey, Durham, Greenwich, Regents, South Hampton, Innsbruck, Italy, Monaco plus others in UAE, KSA, and Lebanon.

Further, it is noted that Professors of Dubai Campus are continuously carrying out various research projects in areas of their professional expertise. These professors and other staff are also working to establish relationships for programs and research areas, cross-campus student events, networking, as well as developing faculty cooperation in research and teaching.

The Dubai Campus is working with MODUL University Vienna Private University in widening and expanding existing relationships the Vienna campus has with HEIs in Florida, Netherlands, UK, Turkey, Ireland, Australia, Mexico, China, Denmark, Malaysia, France, Spain, Germany. These collaborations aim to foster student and staff mobility.

In a thorough examination of the Curriculum **BBA in Tourism and Hospitality Management** and in particular the Structure of Modules I-X, it was noted that the Content, Teaching Aims, Teaching Approach, Assessment Method, Workload and Basic Literature are all appropriate.

However the language of instruction is English. It might be that some seminars would benefit from Arabic also being a language of instruction. This might provide fluidity in discussions which is seen as a key skill to be developed. Indeed, there could have been more reference in 'skills' and 'competencies' to the relevance of learning to the situation found in the UAE.

In examining the **BSc in International Management**, it is noted that MODUL University Vienna Private University is attempting to recreate the success of the BSc in International Management program in Vienna on the Dubai Campus. It is suggested that this could have market attraction. The English-language instruction and international orientation of the university were considered to be a competitive advantage by the surveyed experts.

However, in light of a burgeoning increase in private universities and modular degree courses in similar disciplines to those being advanced by MODUL University Vienna Private University, it may be that the 'competitive advantage' could now be attained by having both English AND Arabic as languages of instruction (or languages of seminar discussion, at least).

In examining employability of graduates from the degree programmes, it is stated that one should recognise that 'jobs are more difficult to get in larger international corporations than in smaller businesses' it may be that confidence in International Management (indeed, in ALL degree subjects) would be enhanced if it was taught through a bi-language method of instruction. That being the case, graduates might find local jobs easier to acquire, might quickly evidence their grasp of job-content in a multi-language environment, and thereby might speedily advance into employment in larger international corporations.

This is especially the case as the program 'optimally prepares students for an academic career'. Having confidence in both Arabic and English might be an additional advantage for the Campus Dubai graduate. Whilst recognizing that a small percentage of the Campus Dubai student intake may not have Arabic as their first language, it is certainly the case that the vast majority of these students will definitely not have English as their first language.

In examining the BSc in International Management , attention is once again drawn to 'skills' and 'competencies'. It could be suggested that by being 'able to apply effective criteria for selecting sources of information' all such information could be in both the English and Arabic languages. Is there any scope for students to delineate pertinent information in Arabic source material?

In examining Strategic Planning it was noted that there are clear Teaching Aims. However, in learning about buyer behaviour, it could be fascinating to provide an opportunity to conduct research into different socio-cultural contexts of 'buyer behaviour'. Indeed, this may be an aspect of the curriculum, but it is not indicated as such.

In examining Foreign Investment Strategy, a reference on Development Theory would be helpful for students. Something basic might be suitable. Perhaps Introduction to the Sociology of Development by Andrew Webster (Macmillan 2000), although there are, of course, many such similar texts.

In examining the **MSc in Sustainable Development, Management and Policy** it is noted that the unique selling proposition lies in the consensus of the program with the UAE government plans. These aim for sustainable resource management. Rather than 'consensus' perhaps 'alignment' might be a more suitable concept.

Reference is made to 'graduates of the MSc program at MODUL University Vienna Private University are ready to address the globalization and sustainability challenges…'. How does this relate to the anticipated graduates from Campus Dubai? Will they be in a similar position? On what basis is that judgement being made?

In focusing on the Study Program Orientation Toward the Institution reference is made to MODUL University Vienna Private University, its accreditation procedures, its relevance for sustainable development in a generic sense, research and education in MODUL University Vienna Private University. It would have been advantageous to have a clearer link between these aspects at MODUL University Vienna Private University with those wishing to be developed at Campus Dubai.

In examining the **Master of Business Administration** the link between this degree at MODUL University Vienna Private University and it being offered at the Dubai Campus is made clear. This is a benefit for the reader.

In the context of Environmental Management, it might assist with an 'awareness of cultural traditions' if the content of this module made reference to the national, cultural and social context within which these examinations of sustainable development take place.

In a field so fast developing as this, it may be helpful to ensure more recent texts are included in the reading lists. Indeed, this is an issue to be noted across the board. Only one of the readings for an e-government module is a web-based reference. It may be helpful to include many more web based references. And that applies to all course literature, although most relevant to this course.

Basic Literature for Public Private Partnerships suggests reading on the Central Danube Region Marketing and Development. Is there nothing similar for the UAE region, which would – surely – produce more interest from students and be seen as more relevant to their study of the subject.

Throughout the documentation, it is apparent that the students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

Describe Reasons for the Outcome of Assessment
There is little to indicate that national legislation at the site presents any problem. The DACH Memorandum outlines the legal issues. The remainder of the documentation addresses, in the main, issues relating to administration, structure, processes, and quality concerns.

Regarding educational traditions and cultural differences, this presents more of a problem. There is evidence (as noted above) that the literature of required reading is rather dated; that, in almost all courses and modules, examples and discussion points relate to European and, in particular, Austrian circumstances. It should not be difficult to draw examples from Dubai, UAE and the wider region of the GCC of sustainable development, hospitality and tourism management, international management, services, environmental management, service chain delivery. This would locate the courses beyond Austria and in Dubai but would also maintain their 'mother relationship' to a high quality international organization, MODUL University Vienna Private University.

Although all degree courses and modules make reference to student discussion seminars, student involvement and to staff-student ratios which would allow such participation, nevertheless, it appears that in the arena of the classroom the world outside Dubai, the UAE and the GCC is the one to be recognized, reported upon and held up as the key reference.

This may not be a service to the intellectually able students of Campus Dubai. It may become important to ensure greater integration of the local with the texts referring to the global.

Have the Criteria Been Met?
In part. On the Literature for all Course and Modules – more recent texts and readings should be included, with at least one from within the past two years. Additionally, e-texts and their url designations should be included wherever possible.

Also, wherever possible, modules should refer to examples from the local and regional context as well as the Austrian and European.

4.5 Are the study programmes offered in Dubai included in MODUL University Vienna Private University's quality management system? Do the degree programmes include a regular quality assurance and enhancement process, taking into account also study conditions and programme organization and involving all relevant groups, especially students? (§ 14 (5) d and § 17 (3) a-c)

In responding to these questions, I have looked for evidence in the documents that the study programmes offered in Dubai are included in MODUL University Vienna Private University's quality management system; that the degree programmes include a regular quality assurance and enhancement process, taking into account also study conditions and programme organization and involving all relevant groups, especially students.

In examining the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (28/5/2015) especially the section on Institutional accreditation, it is noted that
a) At the private university, a quality management system is in place which ensures the regular quality assessment of the core responsibilities and fosters their advancement.
b) The structures and procedures of the quality management system have been defined and documented and ensure the participation of full-time and part-time teachers, students, external experts and other relevant stakeholders. The most essential points of the quality management system have been made easily available to the public.
c) The private university ensures that it gathers information that is relevant to a high-quality execution of its core responsibilities, analyses this information and incorporates it into quality-enhancing measures.

These features being the case, it is apparent from the Guidelines that course evaluations, evaluation and development of the study programmes will take place and further measures are carried out regarding student support.

Describe Reasons for the Outcome of Assessment
In the absence of a site visit, my understanding of the comprehensiveness and appropriateness of the quality management system is limited to documentary evidence. In my view this provides adequate reference to regular quality assurance and enhancement processes, which take into account study conditions and programme organisation involving all relevant groups.

Have the Criteria Been Met?
Yes

4.6 Are the study programmes offered in Vienna (main institution) and the location Dubai of uniform quality? (§ 14 (5) d)

In examining this concern, it was noted that under the Dach Agreement the Parties have agreed to introduce existing flagship academic offering of MODUL University Vienna Private University ('academic programs') as well as MODUL's renowned non-academic offering (non-academic programs and or 'vocational programs) in the Campus in Dubai. (Other programs may be introduced at a later stage.)

Further, in the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (28/5/2015)
The qualifications objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

It is noted that the academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale. And the application of the European Credit Transfer System is adequate and plausible.

For the accreditation of degree programmes offered mostly or entirely at a location different from the main site and/or the accredited sites – in addition to the normal requirements – there are clearly defined criteria.

In relation to Intercultural Aspects and Local Traditions – Their Consideration in Teaching and Research, it is stated that Campus Dubai has an emphasis on Middle Eastern traditions and aspects across teaching and research. The documentation notes that through rigorous research at Dubai Campus aimed at promoting regional values and developments in the areas of tourism and hospitality, business, entrepreneurship, finance and law.

Describe Reasons for the Outcome of Assessment.
In the absence if a site visit, my understanding of the study programmes offered in Vienna and Dubai is that they appear to be of uniform quality. The documentary evidence indicates that the curriculum taught in Vienna is carefully replicated in teaching in Dubai.

Have the Criteria Been Met?
Yes

5   Summary and final assessment

The documentation provided by AQ Austria has been extremely comprehensive and exceptionally helpful in writing this Report. I am very aware that the achievements of MODUL University Vienna Private University are well founded in academic, institutional and procedural policy terms. I have no doubt that similar arrangements can be developed at the Campus Dubai.

In light of the narratives noted above, it is apparent that arrangements for institutional development and procedural policy are exceedingly well grounded. I can see no reason why there should not be transmission of the quality institutional structures, procedures and processes from MODUL University Vienna Private University to Campus Dubai.

Reservations apply – and only in slight degree – to the quality of the curriculum being transferred in the degree courses and their modules. It has been noted above that there may be attractive advantages in nuancing course materials and literature for required reading to the local and regional circumstances surrounding the Dubai campus. For example, to assist familiarization with complex concepts and to develop 'critical thinking skills', examples from the UAE, and even the wider GCC region, would be helpful.

It has also been noted above that the use of a wider range of literature for required course module reading would be advantageous. This would be enhanced by the use of literature accessed on-line.

Additionally, having dual language (Arabic and English) teaching might also provide an attractive and competitive edge to the course delivery. In the environment where job opportunities may begin with/in local small businesses, it may be an advantage for graduates to have had exposure to debates and discussions about contextualisations in Arabic, the local language as well as the international language of English.

6   Reviewed documents

Application for the modification of accreditation of MODUL University Vienna, including the Cooperation Agreement between DACH Advisory 'Dach Advisory' and MODUL University Vienna 'MODUL' (page 521-531 of the Application for Accreditation of Study Programs)
Quality Assurance at MODUL University Vienna (Chapter VI of the Application for Accreditation of Study Programs)
Guidelines of Academic Self-Administration at Dubai Campus (Appendix VIII of the Application for Accreditation of Study Programs)

Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (25/5/2015)

Additional References
Bologna declaration (1999, June 19)
http://www.magna-charta.org/resources/files/BOLOGNA_DECLARATION.pdf

Donn, G. & Al Manthri, Y. (2010) Globalisation and Higher Education in Arab Gulf States. Oxford: Symposium Books

Donn, G & Al Manthri, Y. (eds) (2013) Education in the Broader Middle East. Oxford: Symposium Books

European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA), (2005) Report on the European Association of Quality Assurance in Higher Education 'Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area'. http://www.enqa.eu/wp-content/uploads/2013/06/ESG_3edition-2.pdf

Harvey, L. & Newton, J. (2007) Transforming quality evaluation: moving on. Westerheijden, D.F. et al. (eds). Quality Assurance in Higher Education: trends in regulation, translation and transformation, 225-245.

Kis, V. (2005) Quality assurance in tertiary education: current practices in OECD countries and literature review on potential effects. OECD Thematic review (www.oecd.org/edu/tertiary/review)

Knight, J. (2011) Education Hubs: a fad, a brand, or an institution. Journal for Studies in International Education, 15(3), 221-240